TRANSCRIPT OF ORAL ARGUMENT BEFORE HON. FORREST 10/1/13 **EXHIBIT C** 

New York, N Cause Show 333 10 DALAAINRO
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK 13 IN RE: SAINT VINCENT'S CATHOLIC MEDICAL CENTERS NEW YORK, ET AL., DALAAINRO

Before:

FORREST, HON. KATHERINE B.

N.Y.

October 1 9:00 a.m.

District Judge

APPEARANCES

AKIN GUMP STAUSS HAUER & FELD, Attorneys for St. Vincent BY: SARAH LINK SCHULTZ ANGELINE L. KOO Garvey Attorneys for SHERYL MENKES MENKES LAW FIRM BY:

LLP Defendant

P.C. DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300 SOUTHERN

805-0300

seated

Please be

Cause everyone.

Show

10

Order

Good morning,

COURT:

THE

DALAAINRO

```
Judge Abrams
                       for
                                          court action
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         and be heard on this
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           I perceived in my and then a rereview
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   date that had been
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     temporary emergency
                      attorney
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           uick review yesterday of the papers and then a rereveapers which is the September 30th date that had bee by the bankruptcy court pursuant to which the state SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
                                                                       MS. SCHULTZ: Good morning, your Honor.
Sarah Schultz and Angeline Koo, Akin Gump Strauss
                                                                                                                                                                                                 temporary
                                                                                                                                                        Good morning
                                                                                                                                                                             this week and
                                                           Menkes
                                                                                                                                                                                                                   on behalf of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               So Part One in this kind
                                                                                                               liquidating trust Eugene
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       The matter's been assigned to
                                                      Good morning, Ms.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       Yes, your Honor, your Honor.
               MS. MENKES: Sheryl Menkes, M-e-n-k-e-s, Elaine Garvey and plaintiff in the state
                                                                                                                                                     THE COURT: All right. Thank you. Good I am sitting as the Part One judge this yesterday the order to show cause for a
                                                                                                                                                                                                               stay in the state pending appeal on be Elaine Garvey through attorney Menkes. Am I pronouncing your name correctly?
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        asked for you folks to come in
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      immediately because of the timing of what
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   in and indeed Part One often does
                                                       All right.
                                                                                                                for the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               it.
                                                                                                                                                  court: All sitting as t
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               who was not able to take
called)
                                                                                                                  Feld, counsel
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       MS. MENKES:
THE COURT:
                                                      THE COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       any event.
(Case
                                                                         MS.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            quick
                                                                                                                                                                                                                emergency
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      i.
                                     creditor
                                                                                                                                                                                           received
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  creditor
                                                                                                                  W
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              the
                                                                                                                Hauer
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  steps
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    stays
                                                                                                                                  Davis
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             very
```

SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS,

```
very narrow one
                                                                            I didn't want to grant
                 to be withdrawn
                                                                                          more than a very limited emergency one day stay until I can figure out what's really going on, so that you folks can fill
                                                                                                                                                                                                                regular claims bar process was noticed up but the information was sent, I think actually, to the hospital narrow.
                                                                                                                                                                           that, Ms. Menkes,
death of that
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            to the hospital, perhaps, where
                                                                And without
                                                                                                                               ex parte, so here we are
                                                                                                                                               the papers,
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            And then the action was commenced and there's been some scuffling back and forth about whether or not the acti
                                                                                                                        me in. And I didn't want to do it ex parte, so here we as As I understand it having been through the paper appears that there was an individual who passed away at a
                                                                                                                                                                                                          that after the bankruptcy occurred there was, the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  And that
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             whether or not the action can be the amount of some potential cov
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 issues.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              dispute.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         subsequent to that there was no timely notice of claim,
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 And
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           I think that's one of the primary
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             litigated in light of the automatic stay.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              there's a
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               residing.
                                            Dismissed with prejudice.
              Elaine Garvey was
                                                             Dismissed with prejudice.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 M
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 1.8
                                                                                                                                                                            hospital which has since entered bankruptcy you were hired within a month or two of the
                                                                            about the facts here,
Show
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             actually, to the hos
I guess, in quotes,
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             nce as to which I understand
So the issue here for this Co
10
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          there is the issue about whether
             creditor
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             least up to
                                        MS. MENKES:
THE COURT:
        action by the understand it.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              decedent was last
                                                                              knowing very much
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              guess, filed.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            litigated at of insurance
                                                                                                                                                                                                             patient
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              can be
             court
```

So with that said, tell me if I've got the contours of situation right, Ms. Menkes and then why don't you go ahead the here for -- because any arrections. However, stay would go before Judge Abrams. However, if the temporary stay, if it doesn't issue I think judge had, she So for me to stay her decision is, I think, the only ore me. It would be a temporary stay in any event -. I we're here for -- because any application, that the action in the state court goes away and there may be nothing left for Judge Abrams. should And it really is whether or not there is basis upon which the Court should overturn a very learned colleague of mine, the chief bankruptcy judge's decision to require the state court action to be dismissed pursuant really to orderly bankruptcy one year and the ased, that he had indicated had very carefully gone through the various rules that are when the patient was served with notice of the bankruptcy proceedings he'd already been dead at least one year and address whatever you'd like to address as to why I are almost correct. don't think that if the temporary stay, if it doesn't don't think there's really anything left to be done. when the patient was served with notes broceedings he'd already been dead at least one y debtor's records indicated that he was deceased, there for at least a year. And it also And I've read through the transcript proceeding and it appeared that the bankruptcy for at least a year. And it SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300 Order issue before me. It would that's all we're here for MENKES: for a applicable here. stay generally, procedure. impose a the and 

court

```
5
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         E COURT: -- in 2010.

MENKES: Because I had to get all the records get them reviewed by an expert. And according law there is the insanity toll CPLR 208, someone SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. (212) 805-0300
                                                         sense
                                                                                                                                                                                                       have
                                                                                                                                               He had
                                                                  that
                                                                                                                              where people are taken out of the community because they function in the community because they're so ill. He happosychosis and dementia. He was transferred there from a
                                                                                                                         a nursing
                                                                                                                                                                                 state
                       the current
                                                         a
                                                                                                    a short
                                                                                                                                                                                                      \vdash
                                             couple of
                                                                 of
                                                                                      He had two admissions in 2010
                                                                                                                                                                                                                              as
                                                                                                                                                                                 the
                                        COURT: Let me ask you just a couple questions so that I can understand, was the patient a long term resident
                                                                                                                                                                            THE COURT: All right. And when was the that you were retained for first filed?

MS. MENKES: In, I believe it was in 20 I believe it was 2013.
                                                                                                                          WAS
                                                                                                                                                                                                                          So why did you wait from
                                                                                                   it was
          Cause
                   kin his daughter,
                                                                                                                         It
          Show
                                                                                                    -- but
                                                                                                                        No, your Honor.
          Order to
                                                                                                 this a
                              wife.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               2010.
                     of
                                                                                                 Was
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      it, he died
                    of his next
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                MENKES:
                                                                                                                      MS. MENKES:
                                                                                       MENKES:
                                                                                                 COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                          THE COURT:
                               administrator and
                                                                                    MS.
THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               MS.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  and
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       MS.
                                                   preliminary the facts. If
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      understand
                    addresses
                                                                                                           hospital?
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 together
                                                                                                                                                                   hospital
                                                                                                                                                                                         action
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            state
                                                                                                                                                                                                              look.
```

6

Cause

doesn't have the

trustee has not come forth with a from the substantive however, .H New York Substantive for medical in my papers said, indicated the of the records was a year with one as a creditor Now for the last person something that counsel for the defendant will address, the trustee I should say, the decedent was listed as a credito second own legal toll from And, apparently -- and this will be According to Erie v. Thompson -- Thompkins, the court has to go by the state court law for substa stated on these HIPAA clear a background timely filed. to care for their own oute of limitations tol with a dead And the New York State Law is very SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. was because the authorizations your Honor. Law is very clear that service of process on a d nullity and I've cited to that New York statute law in the state where they're sitting. New Law is very clear that service of process on - after death and two years after death He was served about dates and stated that the purpose I just wanted to add in term of that the nursing home's own records as I location of the next of kin. creditor. claim was That's correct, I believe it was statute of administrator sent HIPAA compliant capacity records prior to any bar dates complaint authorizations that for litigation. Although the as a So his has a three years their death. So h listed was listed a creditor. listed as credit or. MS. MENKES: THE COURT: reason why he was court has cases. notification. affairs of federal date well TWO

SOUTHERN

appointment served themselves dead for two When the notice was served onto the that the debtor acted reasonably by serving a dead person and that Ms. Garvey was an unknown creditor therefore, publication SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. (212) 805-0300 including what would have been notification of the bankruptcy judge ruled are you tying it something else? It's a nullity by state law. Well, let me just have you pause there. to get goes I've cited decedent of the bankruptcy procedures there were several upon the decedent of the bankruptcy matters. Of any matter, service or process. But including here most importantly The executor of estate trying point is that under state law the service issue dead person is stayed pending the actual I can look for it in my papers. The executor of eknown creditor. So therefore that required actual the underlying motion that went on the bankruptcy Elaine Garvey became the In addition, Elaine Garvey became the the estate and there's a bankruptcy case which Was The debtors The decedent had been Cause or onto process for that point, That was the point I Show claim was served 10 to him. Order Correct. No. served at their own facility. MENKES: MS. MENKES: MS. MENKES: THE COURT: MS. MENKES: THE COURT: COURT: service of notice of œ different notices administrator. with THE service proceeding. the the years. Your when Does the 

court is because And it was -- a complaint was never demanded you decedent was THE COURT: I see what you are saying.

MS. MENKES: So, based on those two issues -- well, there was also another issue. I had commenced a state court action before I knew of any bankruptcy proceedings. And it Holy sued the say the that or me cause I served a summons with notice that I hired an investigator and he said they're bankruptcy.

THE COURT: Let me inception. THE COURT: All right. Did you understand that H Name Homes that they were associated with St. Vincent's? MS. MENKES: Yeah, Holy Family. There's a state I was trying to me just ask you -- let me probe of let me ask you, the reason is the operator known creditor 1.s a Saint Vincent's was MS. MENKES: No because there's cases that Homes that they were MS. MENKES: Yeah, Holy Faute.

MS. MENKES: Yeah, Holy Faute.

Ite that says that St. Vincent's is the operate that says that St. Vincent's is the operate that says that St. Vincent's is the operate that says that St. Vincent's 1805-0300

(212) 805-0300 the executor of an estate, not a bankruptcy estate Cause and owner of Holy Family Home where only through the state court action when Show Garvey was a the decedent was listed as a creditor So this a Saint to Correct. to why I was never Well, a position that Ms. MS. MENKES: sufficient. THE COURT: on that. website that little bit DAIAAINRO operator creditor patient. Family take 

So I proceeded in state court with an order to show cause to lift the stay up to the level of the insurance policy. In states court it became known conclusively at that point that absolve the adversarial proceeding and that usually is provided. And in addition she never explained why she doesn't have to adhere to coverage jurisdiction with state courts. And they can decide the affects of the stay on third parties such as insurers. I was not -- the trustee never conclusively told me on the phone or wrote me letters that there was no insurance. However, she decision. And my research clearly indicated from the New York Court of Appeals and many other cases that there's concurrent concurrent can decide the as insurers. I documentary evidence and this is an that there is also did operator and the facility. However, New York State Insurance Law required Law that deems insurance someone, a corporation or entity is not coverage. Therefore, I also courts could undertake this insurance coverage provided and bankruptcy does Cause in my papers -- requires Show need for this insurance coverage. research about if state courts cou was no insurance coverage. Insurance I would like to add didn't provide me any the New York State mandatory even if s cited to that too bankruptcy.

Whether COURT: That there was no insurance?
MENKES: The coverage had been exhausted.
SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
(212) 805-0300

10	DY.	
$\vdash$	or not there's insurance coverage does not absolve the tort	
N	just another pocket to pay for	
m	aintiff. If you don't have insurance	
4	wn pocket. So	
Ŋ	3 COURT: But it strikes me a	
9	t the failure to file a	
7	y put the debtor in or the	
σ	ssue.	
on	Q	
10		
11	THE COURT: I understand. But it strikes me that we	
12	Vou can det a notice of ol	
13	5	
14	MS. MENKES: Right. That's going to be in the appeal	
15	ue there was excusable neglect	
16	think I have to argue the merits of the appeal	
17	s chance a lot of success	
18	er show a likelihood of su	
19	that it would convince me	
20	te of claim that what	
21	MS. MENKES: Well, probably	
22	THE COURT: Hold on. I just was stumbling over the	
23	should be the failure	
24	e the notice of claim should be excused.	
25	MS. MENKES: That's what I plan on arguing in my	
	TERS, P.C.	
	(212) 805-0300	

go to

order

you'd I just want to pause there actors but I know that you'd lich holds as a matter of for the stay to do due excusable whatsoever, the says in It's the this provide them with I think a known Why tal's own records. There's also case law that says to perform due diligence a debtor doesn't have to SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. (212) 805-0300 how does and the the violation of due process. Elaine Garvey was a kno creditor. She was not provided with any notice, whats and the bankruptcy held that notice by publication was understand that every person who died within should be excused actual notice of the bankruptcy proceeding otherwise the violation of due process. Elaine Garvey was a kn OL .H. The debtor has prongs The notice of claim because Would you like me to argue that have to notify every executor? IS: No, it's not the hospital. debtor's process server has to do due diligence claim there But then we'll go on to the other factors but said before that there's case law which holds Cause There are four a known creditor. and Show me why it The notice of phone creditors Let me just -failed. Order because the debtor Tell OK. 00 hospital's own records. THE COURT: MS. MENKES: law that an executor MS. MENKES: MS. MENKES: diligence to locate THE COURT: COURT: 1,4 in place. facility, does THE sufficient. understand DALAAINRO hospital neglect notice pe and to 

to check their own Cause Show do t 0 Order extraordinary measure but they records.

So what would they have checked here that them that there was a claim for medical would have notified THE COURT: malpractice?

their own records showed they had that his next of kin been forward there. They had served him after he died. creditor their own records would show facility in 2010 and that his next of ) and the notices could have listed him as a creditor. They If they knew he was a creditor Well, that he had left the MS. MENKES: was listed as,

In addition, Elaine Garvey prior to the bankruptcy sent a HIPAA compliant authorization and asked for his records because for the purposes of litigation. So, that went to the medical record department. This service was an invasion of due that she was correct, she can no Louger .... again. "Dismissed with prejudice" means that's it. on appeal because there would be irreparable harm to it would eviscerate this Court's decision to determine Garvey because her statute of limitations has now expired service and it eviscerates this Court's determine the issue -- if the stay is not dismissed harm to appeal her case is dismissed in state court if that's the anisms that would prevent any SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, 1 (212) 805-0300 addition, Elaine Garvey prior prejudice, even in this Court hears and determine the And there is no harm to the papers mechanisms and proper to hear granted it the issues and finds case ever process ability with M S

```
court
                                                                                                                              notice of claim which would then allow you to start and to
                                                                                                                                                                                    that the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        dismissing her case pending the outcome and determination of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             would take to wind its way, the appeal would take to wind its way, the appeal would take to wind i way through the appellate division or through the district SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. (212) 805-0300
                                                                                                                            t a
                                                                                                                                                                                                      case
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            if the stay is granted of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             .H
                                 in the state court action
                                                                         Just and pending the determination
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          has
                                                                                                     MENKES: Excusable neglect. COURT: Which would then allow you to file
                                                                                                                                                                                                    M
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            she
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    and have that determination made by
                                                                                                                                                               procedurally positioned to get a lifting of the stay.

MS. MENKES: Because it's my understanding th
bankruptcy court cannot determine damages. There's a
don't recall the name offhand but it either has to go
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         she
                   to stay the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            says, no,
                                                                                                                                                                                                                             state court. They can't --
I: Well, that isn't for today.
ES: Yeah. So if the stay is go
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         least
   Cause
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       can be dismissed but at
                                              the determination of the appeal. And so if you look --
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       the appeal, then if the Court on appeal entitled, then it can be dismissed but
   Show
                   agreement
            example, I would be in total agaction, to stay any litigation
                                                                                         that would go to
MS. MENKES: Ex
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          MS. MENKES:
                                                                          COURT:
                                                                                                                      THE COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                         district court or
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     right to be heard
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 appellate court.
                                                                          THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            THE
                                             pending the
DAIAAINRO
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   entitled,
                                                                                         appeal
```

DALAAINRO

```
And what's your understanding?
unsel for the trustees. What's
ve one, of the timing of the
                           index
                                                                                                                                            a briefing
                                                                                                                                                                         as we get the briefing schedule we'll get
in the papers. I would not think that it
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          going
                                                                                                                                                                   us the
                            an
                                                                                                                                                                                                            THE COURT: All right. And which is the trustees. Let me hear from the counsel for the trustees.
                                                                                               MS. MENKES: And so the next step is to get a least, that we had 14 days to file. 14 days to airrear 14 days to put in the would take.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       proceeding g
t thing that
                         assigned
                                                                                              my --
d help?
                                              Nho is it in front of?
I want to say Judge Glover.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         J.
                     Well, it's already been
                                                                               No. Gardephe?
They it had written on n
: Your Honor, if I could
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        NKES: I don't understand.
URT: When is the bankruptcy r
Are you going to be the last
Cause
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300
                                             Who is it in front
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   your understanding of, if you have one, bankruptcy?
Show
                                  a judge.
                                                                                                                                                                                                           All right.
                  MS. MENKES: "CL. It's been assigned a THE COURT: Who is i
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           this from being
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       SOUTHERN
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        MS. MENKES:
THE COURT:
                                                                               THE COURT:
MS. MENKES:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 be wrapped up?
                                                                  Glover?
                                                                                                                                                                                                                        And then
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            prevents
          court?
                                 number
                                                                  Judge
```

S

you

that

unusual

know. not

don't km

MENKES:

MS. THE

Cause

```
is the last climb claims
                                                                                                                                                                                                      Of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           MS. SCHULTZ: Sure, your Honor. I'm happy to start and then there are a couple of other points I would like
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          claims
                                                                                                                                                I honestly don't know, your Honor.
Let me hear from Ms. Schultz. You can
'd like but I would like to get a sense o
ading, where it stands, how far along it
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        So, first with respect to where we're ss, your Honor, I reported to the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             doe
                                                               creditor she'd
                        was wondering if you'd
                                                                                                                    know how late in the game
                                                                                  to whatever
                                                                                                                                                                                  start where ever you'd like but I would like to get a sen the bankruptcy proceeding, where it stands, how far along and whether or not a quick appeal to Judge Castel really any significant harm to that process.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 We have a number of unliquidated ut as soon as we've resolved those
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  then some other points I'd like to make.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                September, which was have 18 liquidated cl
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       ell. But as soon as we've resolv
SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
(212) 805-0300
                                                                               the other creditors were entitled
                                                           she was in line as a
                                        that you'd learned.
COURT: OK. It is not not your bailiwick but
                                                                                                                    I just don't
                                                                                                 dollar based on
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     Absolutely.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               were before them and we
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                on the 19th of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         in the bankruptcy process,
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         SCHULTZ:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 remaining to resolve. to resolve as well. I
                                       of timing tha MS. MENKES:
                                                                                                                                                     MENKES:
                                                                                                                                                                            COURT:
                                                                                                                  THE COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        COURT:
                                                                                                 percentage of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               bankruptcy court
                                                                                                                                                                            THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   to rebut and
                                                                                                                                                         MS.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       THE
                                                                               whatever
                                                                                                                                        coming
                  It's
                                        OF
                                         a sense
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 there
                                                                                                                                      she's
                    know.
                                                                               get
```

although would be required certainly make it to make our reality is that the post petition claim, if it is an e got one more large claim, the alleged amount, althousen nothing but just an allegation contained in the it that we were eventually served in the state court certainly make that action is a ten million dollar claim alleged by Ms. Menkes. And it's a period that straddled the pre and the post petit impossible for us to recommend the liquidating trustee that they make a distribution to the creditors that have timely vate being in a position t creditors that have been And the admin in connection with that would almost reserve that we Show we don't know if that's an distribution. a distribucio large claim, claims we anticipate And so the using 2010 to receive distribution unsecured claim. So remaining complaint we've there's to make period. initial since if we'

And you anticipate to understand that to have a THE COURT: Let me just make sure the 18 liquidated claims are getting ready distribution paid, there or thereabouts. A

be resolved. 10 consolutions, So we're talking thousands of claims, Those literally. We'll be receiving their initial distribution goal is to make it during the fourth quarter of 2013. couple is in Which unsecured creditor body. THE COURT: months.

DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300 SOUTHERN

I want to see how much to give period

would reserve the i.t to give that assurance, your Honor, I thuse it would help us with the amount of sure that we would need to make. I am not sure t SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, help because that

OF

REPORTERS, 05-0300

SOUTHERN

THE COURT:

deal

```
'large. I could easily adjust
to even settle with their claims
                           allow you
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         you could
                                                                                                                                looking for ten million dollars, she's really looking for two million or $1.5 million maximum and that therefore that also then helps bring down the amount that we're talking about, doe
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      litigation.
                                                                                                                                                                                       she was able to give a more refined
                                                               THE COURT: So let me go with number two. So one if Ms. Menkes is able to say that the pre-period is
                                                                                                                      records she's not
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 that ten million would be
                                                                                                                                                                                                                               those two things
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           like the major point that the
                                                                                           the not post period that
What if she's also able
king at these records sh
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        is that
                                                                                                                                                                                                                 let me turn to
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     protracted li
with as part
TERS, P.C.
                            -H
                           Does
                                         that?
Cause
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      is making which is a significant one
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               be a hold up to any distributions.
1S. MENKES: Your Honor, that ten m
                            help?
                                           away
                                                                                                                                                                                                               COURT: All right. Now, let
Are you able to do either of
                                                                                                                                                                                                demand, that would help, yes. COURT: All right. Now, let
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       and
                         How much does it
                                                                                        looking for and the not
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      go through long
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 at I can't DISTRICT R (212) 805
                                                                                          looking of the problem. What
                                                    It might.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         damnum and they're usually very this down and would be willing t
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         because if you are it sounds
                                                                                                                                                                                     ΙĘ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  That
                                                                                                                     after three years of
                                     distribution?
                                                                                                                                                                    then help you?
MS. SCHULTZ:
           I know it's
                                                   MS. SCHULTZ:
THE COURT:
                         THE COURT:
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      than
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      people rather
                                                                                                                                                                                                               THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                   and
                                                                                                         part
                                                                                                                                                                                                                            Ms. Menkes.
                                        Щ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   otherwise
DALAAINRO
                                                                                           she
             problem.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      trustee
                                       to make
                                                                                                                                                                                                   request
                                                                                                         solves
```

```
your
                                                                                                                                                                             say,
                                                                                                                                                Schultz,
                                                                                                                                a post petition pre-confirmation that's the confusion.
                                                        facility
                                                                             died
                                                                                                       The bankruptcy was
                                                                                                                                                              the reserve,
               definitely
                                                                                                                                                                            going
                                          then
                                                                                                                                                Ms.
                                                                                                                                                      So, we can get the ad damnum down to
                                                        the
                                                                                                                          filing.
                                                                    so?
He died pre-bankruptcy.
                                                                                                                                                                           I was
                                          And
                                                                                                                                                that,
                            1.5?
                                                        left
                                                                                          filed
 Cause
              \vdash
                             to
                                                                                                                                                                          HULTZ: It does help. What SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300
                                          damnum.
                                                        he
                                                                                                                           It is a post petition
                                                                                                                                                So how does
                                                                                                                                                             in terms of
                                                                                         The bankruptcy was
               yes,
                            down
                                                      well,
 Show
                                                                                                       June.
               18,
                                                 is not an issue?
                            i,
                                         And then an ad
                                                                                                                                 It's a post
10
                                   can.
                            get
               answer
                                                                                                       i.
                                                                                                                                                            does that help you
                                                       The post
                     ad damnum clause.
                                                                                                                     Um-hmm.
                                                                                                                                               I right.
                            Can you
                                                                                                       He died
                                                                                                                                        think, perhaps,
                                                                    Yeah,
                                   Yes,
              The
                                                                           So.
                                                                                                                                                                    post period?
SCHULTZ: It
                                                                                                                                  SCHULTZ:
                                                                                        SCHULTZ:
                                                                                                                    SCHULTZ:
       today.
                                  MENKES:
                                                      MS. MENKES:
                                                                           MENKES:
                                                                                                                           COURT:
                            COURT:
                                         COURT:
                                                 period
                                                                    THE COURT:
                                                                                                      COURT:
                                                                                                                                                      impact things?
                                                             pre-petition.
                                                                                                                                                                   the
                    the
                                  MS.
THE
                                                                                                                           THE
                                                                                                                                  MS.
                                                                                                                                               THE
                                                 post
                                                                           MS.
                                                                                         MS.
              MS.
                                                                                                             of
MS
                                                                                                                                                                           MS.
                                                                                                                                                             level
       proceeding
                                                                                  2010.
                                                                                                                                        claim and
DALAAINRO
                                                                                                                                                                    for
                                                                                                             in April
                                                the
                                                                                                                                                            lower
know f
                                                                                               Honor
                                                                                  June
                                                 say
```

not hundreds itting onto be distributed is the amount that the estate is f millions. So it certainly helps. I would need to sit with trustee to determine if that got us to where we could make distribution but it definitely gets us much closer to being ole to make one to have that amount down.

THE COURT: All right. Of parlance hundreds as St. Vincent's and everybody asserted that she was going to argue in the context of her MS. SCHULTZ: Okay. One point that I'd like to and I think this is important because Ms. Menkes of an in the bankruptcy on is I don't make that assumption. you think cash we are sitting when appeal that she had mapped what we I know it's difficult It's not. large of your Honor, I know - organization that's as l of doors. THE COURT: of millions. the trustee Of assumes t millions the wind sitting o able to clarify points. 

you have late a know, read you P.C. you do DISTRICT REPORTERS, (212) 805-0300 Schultz, if COURT: But Ms. SOUTHERN MS. SCHULTZ: down. THE to slow

clear at

Judge Morris was very and I'm reading from the

the Pioneer standard which is the standard for

filed proof of claim,

late

September 19 hearing

on 22.

20

on the one hand as I understand the bankruptcy court court, your standard which is the of claim. And I think the bankruptcy court but cannot be if the action is dismissed a reason not been decided upon by that the bankruptcy to grant a temporary stay because it would be suggestive of is that She's never a late filed required to go I note claim with prejudice, as no longer has a cli and file a motion that described. not determined If her ear that she's not determined right. So let's just pause you are right, Ms. Schultz, it but tell me if your view is different from this, I've got Ms. Menkes arguing that if she is required stay never been And I disagree. that Ms. Menkes still has that available. y court. to file the just unless REPORTERS, has not been ordered. 96 proof of claim and assert a claim against she needs to go to Judge Morris and file a MS. SCHULTZ: Respectfully I dis is prohibited from going before SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTER to gone forever and creditor Garvey has no that motion before the bankruptcy a motion. So I think that ur never make the motion you've establishes that she's met the Pioneer standard for filing a late filed proof claim has contention is that she should be able motion which could be made which has no standing therefore y clear that s All right. S s if you are n and dismiss her Because what we're dealing with proof of That suggests was very COURT: or a across the street been decided. she would have THE Judge Morris such there. make

claim

DISTRICT | (212) 809

SOUTHERN

of claim claim that has a sum a proceeding? I suppose exist. the consent medical malpractice related claim as to which the damages, if any, or the liability first and then the damages, if there is liability, flow from a determination, judicial determination some sort, how do you file a proof of claim that has a contain attached unless were a proof of claim that has a contain attached unless were a proof of claim that has a contain attached unless were a proof of claim that has a contain attached unless were a proof of claim that has a contain attached unless were a proof of claim that has a contain a says So we to mediation because we have a court approved procedure for that. So we go through a series of offers first. It begins with plaintiff recorded the sending the series of offers first. you've established would be liquidated as plaintiff responds in writing. Liquidating trustee then one more option to respond. If the parties don't reach a personal does not client's failure court attached unless you have such a proceeding? I file the ad damnum amount but you've got to get fown to an actual amount. there's to file a proof settlement we then automatically go to mediation be recognize the bankruptcy court's inability without of the parties to enter an order adjudicating a per And if the bankruptcy are, insurance which go to mediation. There a after insurance d from seeking t excusable neglect with respect to your timely file a proof of claim -yes, you've met the Pioneer standards, court which claim against this entity. Honor, and seeking to go a But she is not prohibited the bankruptcy We you can before 

```
it through
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        the district court but it would be effectively making a med-malpractice determination.

MS. SCHULTZ: That's correct, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right. So let me then make sure I understand the point which is that the gating factor to the procedure that you've just described which would be an alternative route to coming up with an amount, if any, is appropriate requires, first, that a motion be made to the bankruptcy court for excusable neglect and that a late notice southern DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
                                                                                                                                                                                                 a med-malpractice claim
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             late notice
                                                                                                                                                                                               but on the bankruptcy issue.

MS. SCHULTZ: On the determination of amount of the MS. SCHULTZ: On the district court to look at the indiction of another is the mould require the district court and this is how
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          claim and say this is the appropriate amount and this is how much you're entitled to assert against the estimate.

THE COURT: All right. So it's almost like a
                   The plaintiff gets of the mediation,
                                                                      plaintiff has the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        a bankruptcy proceeding and it would be sort of an appeal the district court but it would be effectively making a
                                                                                                    estimated by
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       You're making
                                                                                                                           court
                                               At the conclusion
                                                                                              to either have the claim
                                                                     the medication is unsuccessful then the
                                                                                                                          go to district
 Show
                                                                                                                                                                     Federal court.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    med-malpractice claim within a claim.
                          were approved.
                                                                                                                                            District court?
 10
Order
                                                                                                                                             SCHULTZ: Fear
                                                                                                                           we can
                       that
                                       select the mediator.
                                                                                                                                             THE COURT:
                                                                                                                     bankrupt court or
                   mediators
                                                                                               discrimination
                                                                                                                                                                     MS.
                     four
```